

# Case 11: Why are Jordy and Gia paid different rates?

## Content note

This case explains general rules. It is not legal advice for your situation.

## Overview

Students read a story in which Jordy and Gia work the same Saturday event. Jordy is paid \$16.50 an hour, and Gia is paid \$18.00. They compare the pay statements and the crew schedule, which lists Gia as shift lead, with federal pages on pay discrimination and on discussing wages. They then draft Jordy’s message to the supervisor asking how the rates were set.

## Before this case

Students should already be able to:

- read a pay statement and a work schedule
- summarize an official agency web page accurately
- plan a conversation with a supervisor

## Objectives

Students will be able to:

- prepare a record of hours, duties, title and rate from the case documents
- write a message that asks how rates are set without claiming discrimination
- use Gia’s rate only as she agreed and keep her statement private

## Objectives, continued

- plan next steps for a satisfying answer, a need for more facts and a possible legal issue

## Materials

- This chapter, one copy per student
- Evidence A, B and C
- The EEOC Youth@Work page on pay discrimination and the NLRB page on discussing wages
- A record sheet and a next-step chart

## The task in this edition

**Task:** Write Jordy’s message to the supervisor and a one-page plan for the conversation. The plan lists the record Jordy brings, what Gia agreed to share, the questions to ask and Jordy’s options after each kind of answer.

**Students make:** Message, 80–120 words, plus a one-page conversation plan

## Pacing

**Opener (page 213):** 5 min. Short on time: 5 min.

**Key terms (pages 214 and 215):** 5 min. Short on time: skip.

**Look at the evidence (page 219):** 8 min. Short on time: 8 min.

**Look at the evidence (page 220):** 4 min. Short on time: 4 min.

## Pacing, continued

**Key idea (pages 221 and 222):** 10 min. Short on time: 8 min. Skip In the news.

**Sort the evidence (page 223):** 6 min. Short on time: skip. The record sheet covers the same comparison.

**Practice (page 224):** 5 min. Short on time: skip.

**Your task (pages 225 and 226):** 10 min. Short on time: 10 min.

**Your draft (page 227):** 25 min. Short on time: 25 min.

**Check your work (pages 228 and 229):** 6 min. Short on time: 5 min. Students answer the Check your work questions only.

**Questions to discuss (pages 230 and 231):** 10 min. Short on time: 10 min.

**Talk about this case at home (page 232):** at home.

**Periods:** full chapter 94 minutes; one period 75 minutes.

## Standards

**Ethical Reasoning VALUE Rubric** AAC&U’s rubric for recognizing ethical issues and applying and weighing different ethical perspectives. In this case: Students decide how to use a coworker’s pay information that she agreed to share and keep her statement private (Ethical Issue Recognition).

## Case 11 plan, continued

### Standards, continued

#### Written Communication VALUE Rubric

AAC&U's rubric for writing that fits its context and purpose, develops its content and uses sources and evidence. In this case: Students write a workplace message and a plan for the conversation (Context of and Purpose for Writing).

**Critical Thinking VALUE Rubric** AAC&U's rubric for exploring issues, evidence and assumptions thoroughly before forming a conclusion. In this case: Students state the pay question and the facts it depends on before they draw any conclusion (Explanation of Issues).

**Information Has Value** Information has value, including as a means to influence people, so credit, access and privacy matter. In this case: Students explain the right to discuss wages that the NLRB page describes and how it applies to comparing pay statements.

### Codes of ethics

- **SHRM Code of Ethics:** Fairness and Justice
- **SHRM Code of Ethics:** Use of Information
- **IABC Code of Ethics for Professional Communicators:** "I protect confidential information"

### Heat map

■■□ **Opener (page 213):** Medium

### Heat map, continued

- **Key terms (pages 214 and 215):** Low
- **Look at the evidence (page 219):** Low
- **Look at the evidence (page 220):** Low
- **Key idea (pages 221 and 222):** Low
- **Sort the evidence (page 223):** Low
- **Practice (page 224):** Medium
- **Your task (pages 225 and 226):** Low
- **Check your work (pages 228 and 229):** Low

### Try it at your school

#### Know how pay decisions are made where you work.

- Ask for your pay rate and how it's set in writing when you start a job
- Keep your own record of hours and duties
- Talk with a trusted adult or counselor if something seems off
- Look up your state labor department's pay-equity page

**Who to ask:** Supervisor or HR, school counselor, state labor department, the EEOC's public information line

**Safety:** Don't share coworkers' pay information without their permission. Deadlines apply to formal complaints, so ask a qualified adviser early if you think there's a legal issue.

### Sources

- NPR, "The U.S. national women's soccer team wins \$24 million in equal pay settlement," February 22, 2022
- NPR, "Federal Judge Dismisses U.S. Women's Soccer Team's Equal Pay Claim," May 2, 2020
- U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC), "Pay Discrimination," No date listed
- National Labor Relations Board (NLRB), "Your Right to Discuss Wages," No date listed

# Case 11: Why are Jordy and Gia paid different rates?

Jordy and Gia worked the same Saturday event, but Gia's pay rate is \$1.50 an hour higher, and Jordy wants to know why.

**On your own** Read What happened. Underline the two pay rates and the job title on the schedule. About 5 minutes.



Mateo attaches an arrival notice at the Common Room entrance. Gia points to the doorway, and Jordy checks what a visitor will see.

**Your role:** You're the one who lines up both shifts side by side before Jordy writes to Dana. **New skill:** Compare two cases on the same terms.

## What happened

Jordy and Gia work event shifts for the same company. They both worked a Saturday event from 3 to 11 p.m. Both helped with setup and closing, and Jordy also ran the caption and audio check.

They were paid the following Friday. On Sunday afternoon, Jordy and Gia compare pay statements. Jordy's lists eight hours at \$16.50 an hour. Gia's lists \$18.00 an hour for the same event.

The crew schedule lists Gia as "shift lead," but it does not say what that job includes. That day, Gia opened up and handled one guest issue. She does not know if that explains the \$1.50 difference. Gia is fine with Jordy knowing her rate. But she does not want her statement posted.

Jordy wants to ask Dana, the supervisor, how rates are set. Jordy will not post anything before Dana answers.

**Your question:** Why is Gia paid more than Jordy for the same event, and how should Jordy ask about it?

## ⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 5 min.

✂ Short on time: 5 min.

## 💬 Say this

"Two friends, same event, same hours, different pay. What is your first reaction?" — Hear three answers. Write them on the board without judging them.

## 👁 Watch for

**Misconception:** Students decide the gap proves discrimination. **Listen for:** "That's illegal." **Then:** Ask what else could explain \$1.50. Add "shift lead" to the board.

## 📄 Support

- Read What happened aloud. Pause after each pay rate so students can underline it.

## 🔥 Heat check

■ ■ □ **Medium.** Students may connect the gap to Jordy's identity or share a family member's pay.

**Cool-down:** Say: "We only know what the documents show." Nobody needs to share their own pay or a family member's.

## Key terms

**On your own** Read each key term and its example. Then write your first guess about the pay difference. About 5 minutes.

**Compensation** Compensation is all the pay and benefits a worker receives, including hourly rates, bonuses and overtime.

En español: compensación

**In this case:** Jordy's statement shows eight hours at \$16.50 an hour, and Gia's shows \$18.00. The statements show the rates but not how they were set.

**Equal Pay Act** The Equal Pay Act is a federal law from 1963 that requires equal pay for men and women who do equal work.

En español: Ley de Igualdad Salarial

**In this case:** The Equal Pay Act covers pay differences based on sex, not every difference. Different job duties, such as a real shift-lead role, can be a lawful reason.

**Title VII** Title VII is part of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. It bans job discrimination based on race, color, religion, sex or national origin.

En español: Título VII

**In this case:** Title VII covers pay decisions based on race, color, religion, sex or national origin. No document shows how Jordy's rate was set.

## Who is involved



**Jordy**

Worked setup through close

"Three to eleven, setup to close, and I ran the caption and audio check. \$16.50 an hour. Gia's says \$18.00."



**Gia**

Listed as shift lead

"I only found out I make more because Jordy showed me theirs. The schedule calls me shift lead. Nobody told me what that pays for."

### 🕒 Pacing

Full chapter: 5 min.

✂ Short on time: skip this page.

### 💬 Say this

"Compensation is more than the hourly rate. What else could count?" — Listen for overtime, bonuses and benefits.

### 👁 Watch for

**Misconception:** Students think the Equal Pay Act covers every pay difference. **Listen for:** "Any pay gap breaks the Equal Pay Act." **Then:** Reread the definition. The law is about men and women doing substantially equal work.

### 📄 Support

- Preteach "rate" and "gross pay" with Jordy's statement: 8 hours × \$16.50 = \$132.00.
- **Cognates:** compensation (compensación), discrimination (discriminación), supervisor (supervisor), evidence (evidencia), criteria (criterios), difference (diferencia), information (información), private (privado), legitimate (legítimo).

### 🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

### 🔑 Answer key

Any first guess is fine. Students return to it on the My take page.

## Your first guess

Before you look at the evidence, why do you think Gia is paid more than Jordy?

My first guess is \_\_\_, because \_\_\_.

➤ My first guess is that Gia's shift-lead title comes with a higher rate, because the schedule lists her that way.

## Notes

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal blue ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There is no handwriting or other markings on the paper.

This page continues page 214. The notes for both pages are on the sheet for page 214.

## Reading passage

### Pay equity, comparators and the right to ask

**On your own** Read the passage. At each Stop and think box, pause and answer the question in your head or with a partner. About 5 minutes.

#### Words to know

- **Compensation:** Compensation is all the pay and benefits a worker receives, including hourly rates, bonuses and overtime.
- **Equal Pay Act:** The Equal Pay Act is a federal law from 1963 that requires equal pay for men and women who do equal work.
- **Title VII:** Title VII is part of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. It bans job discrimination based on race, color, religion, sex or national origin.
- **Gross pay:** Gross pay is the money you earn before any taxes or other deductions are taken out.

#### The story: Discovering a differential

Jordy and Gia work event shifts for the same company. On a Saturday, both worked from 3 to 11 p.m. and shared setup and closing. Jordy also ran the caption and audio check. The schedule named Gia “shift lead” without defining the role. On Sunday, comparing statements, they find a \$1.50 hourly difference: \$16.50 for Jordy and \$18.00 for Gia.

The case models how most workers actually discover pay differences, which is informally, through a coworker. Gia learns she is paid more only because Jordy shows her. Neither of them knows the policy behind the rates. Gia can describe what she did as lead, opening up and handling one guest issue, but not whether the company values that at \$1.50 an hour.

What follows is a careful sequence. The friends agree on the facts: same event, same hours, two rates. Gia consents to Jordy knowing her rate and withholds consent to posting her statement. Jordy chooses to ask Dana, the supervisor, how rates are set before posting anything, and keeps the decision about what to do next. Asked whether the gap is discrimination, Gia says she does not know. Maybe shift lead pays more. The first step is to ask what it covers.

Your role is to line up both shifts side by side before Jordy writes to Dana.

**Stop and think.** How does the choice of comparator change the answer in both the soccer case and Jordy’s?

### Pacing

Reading: about 5 min (745 words). Short on time: read it aloud together, pausing at each Stop and think.

### Stop and think

1. **After “The story: Discovering a differential”:** How does the choice of comparator change the answer in both the soccer case and Jordy’s?
2. **After “Constructing a fair comparison”:** Which legitimate explanations for the \$1.50 are plausible, and what evidence would test each?
3. **After “Law, litigation and professional standards”:** How should a worker balance the right to discuss pay with a coworker’s wish to keep records private?

**Constructing a fair comparison**

The new skill is comparing two cases on the same terms before drawing a conclusion. It extends Case 5's line-by-line reading. Jordy's statement shows 8.0 hours at \$16.50, or \$132.00 in **gross pay**, the money earned before any taxes or other deductions are taken out.

In employment law, the person you compare yourself to is often called a comparator, and the choice of comparator shapes the result. Here the natural comparator is Gia, but the comparison only holds if the jobs are defined. **Compensation** is all the pay and benefits a worker receives, including hourly rates, bonuses and overtime. The evidence establishes identical hours and shared tasks. It also shows one technical task for Jordy and one title with modest added tasks for Gia. It leaves open what the title formally requires and how the employer sets rates. Legitimate explanations such as duties, title and experience are plausible. So is error. The documents cannot distinguish among them.

Case 10's skill, reporting to the office responsible, determines the next move. Dana sets rates, so Dana is asked. A strong message states the observation, lists the verified facts and asks one precise question about what shift lead includes and how rates are determined. It does not rely on Gia's statement, which respects her boundary and keeps the question about Jordy's pay.

 **Stop and think.** Which legitimate explanations for the \$1.50 are plausible, and what evidence would test each?

**Law, litigation and professional standards**

Federal law constrains pay-setting. The **Equal Pay Act** is a federal law from 1963 that requires equal pay for men and women who do equal work. **Title VII** is part of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. It bans job discrimination based on race, color, religion, sex or national origin. The EEOC enforces both and describes retaliation protections (EEOC, no date listed). Separately, the NLRB explains that most private-sector employees may discuss wages with coworkers, with or without a union (NLRB, no date listed). A right to discuss one's own pay is not a license to publish a colleague's records.

The women's national soccer team litigation illustrates the comparator problem at scale. In 2020, a federal judge dismissed the equal pay claim, emphasizing structural differences between the men's and women's contracts (NPR, May 2, 2020). The players appealed, arguing that rates of pay were the relevant comparison. The 2022 settlement, \$24 million with a commitment to equal pay rates, resolved the dispute without a finding (NPR, February 22, 2022). The terms were later formalized in signed agreements (PBS NewsHour, September 6, 2022).

Broader trends frame the stakes. Pew reports that the gender pay gap has narrowed only slightly over two decades and is smaller for workers ages 25 to 34 (Pew Research Center, March 4, 2025). Salary transparency laws that require posted ranges may make comparisons easier to start (NPR, January 3, 2023).

This page continues page 216. The notes for both pages are on the sheet for page 216.

**Law, litigation and professional standards, continued**

Professional codes describe the employer's side of the conversation Jordy is starting. SHRM members commit to "take appropriate steps to ensure the accuracy and completeness of all communicated information about HR policies and practices" (SHRM Code of Ethics, April 24, 2023). IABC members pledge, "I protect confidential information while acting within the law" (IABC Code of Ethics, no date listed). Dana's answer should meet the first standard, and Jordy's message already meets the second.

**?** **Stop and think.** How should a worker balance the right to discuss pay with a coworker's wish to keep records private?

**Sources**

**Real source** | U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) | No date listed

**Pay Discrimination**

**Real source** | National Labor Relations Board (NLRB) | No date listed

**Your Right to Discuss Wages**

**Real source** | NPR | May 2, 2020

**Federal Judge Dismisses U.S. Women's Soccer Team's Equal Pay Claim**

**Real source** | NPR | February 22, 2022

**The U.S. national women's soccer team wins \$24 million in equal pay settlement**

**Real source** | PBS NewsHour (Associated Press) | September 6, 2022

**U.S. men's and women's soccer teams formally sign equal pay agreements**

**Real source** | Pew Research Center | March 4, 2025

**Gender pay gap in U.S. has narrowed slightly over 2 decades**

**Real source** | NPR | January 3, 2023

**The impact that new salary transparency laws could have**

**Real source** | Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM) | 2023

**SHRM Code of Ethics**

**Real source** | International Association of Business Communicators (IABC) | No date listed

**IABC Code of Ethics for Professional Communicators**

This page continues page 216. The notes for both pages are on the sheet for page 216.

## Look at the evidence

**On your own** Read each document. For each one, fill in both boxes. About 8 minutes.

### Evidence A | Pay statement

#### Jordy's pay statement

Event crew, Saturday. Hours: 8.0 at \$16.50. Gross pay for the event: \$132.00.

**Look closely:** Multiply the hours by the rate. Does it match the gross pay?

#### What it shows

➤ Jordy's own record: 8.0 hours at \$16.50, \$132.00 gross. It is Jordy's to share.

#### What it leaves out

➤ How the rate was set, and whether the company has a written pay policy.

### Evidence B | Work schedule

#### The crew schedule

Saturday event, 3:00—11:00 p.m. Crew: Gia (shift lead), Jordy and two other crew members. Setup, 3:00—5:00: all crew. Caption and audio check: Jordy. Closing, 10:00—11:00: all crew.

**Look closely:** Circle "shift lead." Does the schedule say what that job includes?

#### What it shows

➤ Gia is shift lead; all crew did setup and closing; Jordy ran the caption and audio check.

#### What it leaves out

➤ A job description for shift lead, and whether the title carries its own rate.

## Case 11 | Look at the evidence | College educator edition

### ⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 8 min.

✂ Short on time: 8 min.

### 💬 Say this

"Put your finger on "shift lead." What would you need to know about that title?" — Wait for "what the job includes" and "whether it pays more."

### 👁 Watch for

**Misconception:** Students treat Gia's pay statement as Jordy's to share. **Listen for:** "Jordy can show everyone Gia's statement." **Then:** Point to Evidence C. Gia agreed to let Jordy know her rate, not to post her statement.

### 📊 Support

- Give students a four-column table: duties, hours, title, rate.
- Read the text messages aloud with two voices.
- **Cognates:** compensation (compensación), discrimination (discriminación), supervisor (supervisor), evidence (evidencia), criteria (criterios), difference (diferencia), information (información), private (privado), legitimate (legítimo).

### 🔗 Stretch

- Ask which duty on the schedule belongs only to Jordy, and whether it could matter as much as shift lead.

### 🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

## Look at the evidence, continued

### Evidence C | Text messages

#### Jordy and Gia compare notes

Sunday, 1:15 p.m.

Gia: I'm fine with you knowing my rate. I just don't want my statement posted anywhere.

Jordy: Got it. Did you do anything different as shift lead?

Gia: I opened up and handled one guest issue. Honestly, I don't know if that's why. Let's ask Dana.

**Look closely:** What does Gia agree to share, and what does she ask Jordy not to do?

#### What it shows

🔍 Gia shares her rate with Jordy but asks that her statement not be posted anywhere.

#### What it leaves out

🔍 Whether her lead work explains the rate, and whether Dana may be told her rate.

**What is still missing from the evidence?**

🔍 We don't know what shift lead officially involves or how rates are set. We also don't know whether other criteria explain Gia's rate, what the two other crew members earn or whether a written pay policy exists.

## Case 11 | Look at the evidence | College educator edition

### 🕒 Pacing

Full chapter: 4 min.

✂ Short on time: 4 min.

### 💬 Say this

“Put your finger on “shift lead.” What would you need to know about that title?” — Wait for “what the job includes” and “whether it pays more.”

### 👁 Watch for

**Misconception:** Students treat Gia's pay statement as Jordy's to share. **Listen for:** “Jordy can show everyone Gia's statement.” **Then:** Point to Evidence C. Gia agreed to let Jordy know her rate, not to post her statement.

### 📄 Support

- Give students a four-column table: duties, hours, title, rate.
- Read the text messages aloud with two voices.
- **Cognates:** compensation (compensación), discrimination (discriminación), supervisor (supervisor), evidence (evidencia), criteria (criterios), difference (diferencia), information (información), private (privado), legitimate (legítimo).

### 🔗 Stretch

- Ask which duty on the schedule belongs only to Jordy, and whether it could matter as much as shift lead.

### 🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

## Key idea: equal pay

**On your own** Read the key idea and the code of ethics. Then answer the question in the box. About 10 minutes.

Before you can say why Jordy is paid less, you need to know what each job included. **Compensation** is all the pay and benefits a worker receives, including hourly rates, bonuses and overtime. A job title, extra duties or more experience can explain a pay difference. So can a mistake. The pay statements show the rates, but they do not show how the rates were set.

Federal laws limit the reasons an employer can use to set pay. The **Equal Pay Act** is a federal law from 1963 that requires equal pay for men and women who do equal work. **Title VII** is part of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. It bans job discrimination based on race, color, religion, sex or national origin. Both laws apply to covered employers, and the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) enforces them. A legitimate reason, such as different job duties, can lawfully explain a pay difference.

Talking about pay is protected too. The National Labor Relations Board (NLRB) says most private-sector workers have a right to discuss pay with coworkers. That right holds with or without a union. It does not make Gia's pay statement Jordy's to share. Jordy can ask Dana how rates are set without naming Gia's rate.

### Professional standards

**Real source** | Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM)

#### SHRM Code of Ethics: Fairness and Justice

"Develop, administer, and advocate policies and procedures that foster fair, consistent and equitable treatment for all."

**In plain words:** HR professionals who belong to SHRM agree to use workplace policies that treat workers fairly and consistently.

**Question:** The schedule lists Gia as shift lead. What written policy would show whether that title explains the higher rate?

### Your answer

A policy that answers this would state \_\_\_\_\_. Without it, \_\_\_\_\_.

➡ A policy that answers this would state what shift lead involves and the rate for each role. Without it, Jordy cannot tell a legitimate factor from a mistake.

### ⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 10 min.

✂ Short on time: 8 min. Skip In the news.

### 💬 Say this

"The Equal Pay Act and Title VII limit the reasons for a pay gap. Which reason could be lawful here?" — Wait for "different job duties."

"The SHRM code asks for fair, consistent policies. What written policy would help Jordy?" — Accept "a job description" or "a pay chart."

### 👁 Watch for

**Misconception:** Students treat the SHRM code as a law.

**Listen for:** "The company broke the SHRM code, so it's illegal." **Then:** Say: "SHRM's code binds its members, who are HR professionals. The laws here are the Equal Pay Act and Title VII."

### 📖 Support

- Read the code quotation aloud. Point out its label: a quotation from a real source.

### 🔗 Stretch

- Use the second SHRM card: what should a complete answer from Dana include?

### 🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

## In the news



Real source | NPR | February 22, 2022

## The U.S. national women's soccer team wins \$24 million in equal pay settlement

A real 'same work, different pay' dispute that ended in a settlement and a promise of equal rates.



Real source | NPR | May 2, 2020

## Federal Judge Dismisses U.S. Women's Soccer Team's Equal Pay Claim

Why the claim was first dismissed: the judge compared how the contracts were structured. What you compare shapes the answer.

## Notes

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal blue ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There is no handwriting or other markings on the paper.

This page continues page 221. The notes for both pages are on the sheet for page 221.

## Sort the evidence

**On your own** Line up the accounts in the diagram. Then name one view that is missing. About 6 minutes.

Line up the accounts. Where do they agree, where do they differ, and which difference could be a legitimate factor? What would you need to find out before calling it unfair?

### Account 1

Jordy's record: 8 hours, setup, caption and audio check, closing, \$16.50

### Account 2

Gia's account: same hours, setup and closing, opened up and handled one guest issue, \$18.00

### Account 3

The schedule: Gia listed as shift lead, with no description of the role

### Where they agree

Both worked the same event, the same hours, and setup and closing.

### Where they differ

Title and rate: shift lead at \$18.00 versus crew at \$16.50

**Check:** Ask the supervisor how rates are set and what the shift-lead role requires

## Whose perspective is missing?

Whose view is missing from these documents? What would you ask them?

The view that is missing is \_\_\_\_\_. I would ask \_\_\_\_\_.

The person who sets event-crew rates is missing, and we don't know if that is Dana. I would ask how each rate is decided and whether it is written down.

## Pacing

Full chapter: 6 min.

Short on time: skip this page. Skip this page. The record sheet covers the same comparison.

## Say this

"Line up Jordy's record, Gia's account and the schedule. Where do they agree?" — Model the first link together: both worked setup and closing.

## Watch for

**Misconception:** Students mark the title as proof that the pay is fair. **Listen for:** "She's shift lead, so it's fine." **Then:** Ask what the schedule says shift lead includes. It says nothing. The title leaves the question open.

## Support

- Let students write A (agrees), D (differs) or ? (leaves open) before writing sentences.

## Heat check

Low.

## Practice: choose a response

**On your own** Choose what Jordy should do first and explain why. Then fix the two marked lines.  
About 5 minutes.

Jordy's statement shows \$16.50 an hour. Gia's shows \$18.00 for the same Saturday event, and the schedule lists her as "shift lead." What should Jordy do first?

- ☐ A Tell the rest of the crew that Gia is paid more for the same work.
- ☒ B Compare what each of them did, find out what "shift lead" means and ask Dana how rates are set.
- ☐ C Let it go, because an employer can set any pay rate it chooses.

Why I chose it

➤ B. It tests the likeliest lawful explanation first and keeps Gia's statement private. A exposes a coworker's pay, and C ignores the limits federal law sets.

## Improve a draft

A student's first draft

Hi, I found out Gia makes more than me and we did the exact same work so ① this is discrimination. I know it's because of who I am. I want the same rate as her starting now or I'm going to post about it everywhere so people know how this company treats workers. ② I have her pay stub as proof. I've worked here longer than some people and I always show up on time. Let me know by tomorrow. Jordy

Rewrite each marked phrase so it says only what the evidence supports.

Rewrite phrase 1

➤ I don't know the reason for the difference yet. Could you explain the criteria?

Rewrite phrase 2

➤ My statement shows \$16.50 an hour. I am not sharing anyone else's pay records.

## ⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 5 min.

✂ Short on time: skip this page.

## 💬 Say this

"Jordy has just seen Gia's rate. What should Jordy do first?"  
— Hold a quick vote before any discussion.

## 👁 Watch for

**Misconception:** Students choose C because employers can pay what they want. **Listen for:** "It's their company, they decide." **Then:** Ask what the key idea says. Employers set rates, but federal laws limit the reasons.

## 📖 Support

- Read the options aloud before students choose.

## 🔥 Heat check

■ ■ □ **Medium.** Students may share their own pay or a boss's treatment.

**Cool-down:** Return to Jordy: "What does Jordy know for sure?" No one needs to describe their own job.

## ➤ Answer key

**A revised version:** Hi Dana, I have a question about my pay rate for the Saturday event. I worked setup and closing, from 3 to 11 p.m., and ran the caption and audio check. My statement shows \$16.50 an hour. I understand another worker on the same shift was paid a higher rate. Could you explain how rates are set for event crew, including what the shift-lead role involves and how someone qualifies? If there are criteria I haven't met, I'd like to know what they are. I'd appreciate a reply this week. Thanks, Jordy

## College

## Your task

**On your own** Read the steps. Fill in the planner boxes before you start your draft. About 10 minutes.

Write Jordy's message to the supervisor and a one-page plan for the conversation. The plan lists the record Jordy brings, what Gia agreed to share, the questions to ask and Jordy's options after each kind of answer.

**Use:** Case documents: Jordy's pay statement, the crew schedule with job titles, Jordy and Gia's conversation and Jordy's statement. Real sources: the EEOC's Youth@Work page on pay discrimination and the NLRB page on the right to discuss wages.

**You'll make:** Message, 80–120 words, plus a one-page conversation plan

**Time:** 75 minutes

- 1 Fill in the record sheet from Evidence A and B: date, hours, duties, title and rate.
- 2 Mark what Gia agreed to share in Evidence C, and with whom.
- 3 Write Jordy's message to Dana, 80 to 120 words, on the Your draft page.
- 4 Write the conversation plan: Jordy's next step after each kind of answer.
- 5 Note that formal complaints have deadlines. Say when Jordy should ask a qualified adviser.
- 6 Check your work with the questions on the Check your work page.



Prefer typing? Scan to open the online workspace.

**Record sheet: date, hours, duties, title, rate**

🔊 Saturday event, 3:00–11:00 p.m.; setup, caption and audio check, closing; crew; \$16.50 an hour.

## Case 11 | Your task | College educator edition

## ⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 10 min.

✂ Short on time: 10 min.

## 💬 Say this

“Before Jordy writes to Dana, which records should Jordy have in hand?” — List hours, duties, title and rate on the board.

## 👁 Watch for

**Misconception:** Students plan to lead with Gia's pay statement. **Listen for:** “Jordy should show Dana Gia's statement.” **Then:** Point to Evidence C. Gia agreed to tell Jordy her rate. She did not agree to share her statement.

## 📄 Support

- Record sheet: date, hours, duties, title, rate
- Message frame from the workshop: “We compared these duties and hours. Can you explain the rate?”
- Next-step chart: an explanation that answers the question, a need for more facts, a possible legal issue
- The plan is about Jordy's next steps. Nobody needs to describe their own job or pay.

## 🔗 Stretch

- Explain which facts would make the difference a legitimate factor, such as lead duties. Say when a worker would turn to the EEOC's information, and cite the EEOC page accurately.

## 🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

## Your task, continued

### What Gia agreed to share

- Gia's rate, with Jordy only. Gia does not want her statement posted.

## Questions to ask Dana

What does shift lead include? How are event-crew rates set? How does someone qualify for a higher rate?

## Notes

[illegible]

This page continues page 225.

## Standards

**AAC&U VALUE rubric:** Ethical Reasoning VALUE Rubric; Written Communication VALUE Rubric; Critical Thinking VALUE Rubric.

## ACRL Framework: Information Has Value.

The Case plan sheet gives each code in plain words.

## Answer key

## A strong response:

- The record lists the 3:00—11:00 p.m. shift, the duties and the two rates from the case
- Uses Gia's rate only as she agreed and keeps her statement private
- Asks what "shift lead" includes and how rates are set, without claiming discrimination
- The plan separates a satisfying explanation, a need for more facts and a possible legal issue
- Notes that formal complaints have deadlines and suggests asking a qualified adviser early

## Your draft

**On your own** Write your draft in the boxes. Use your planner from the page before. About 25 minutes.

Jordy's message to Dana, 80 to 120 words

Hi Dana, I'd like to understand how pay rates are set for event crew. For the Saturday event, I worked from 3:00 to 11:00 p.m., did setup and closing, and ran the caption and audio check. My statement shows \$16.50 an hour. I understand another worker on the same shift was paid a higher rate. Could you tell me what the shift-lead role includes, how rates are set and how someone qualifies for a higher one? Thanks for your help. Jordy

Conversation plan: Jordy's next step after each kind of answer

If Dana explains the criteria and they match the duties, Jordy asks how to qualify for shift lead. If Dana gives a vague answer, Jordy asks for the criteria in writing and keeps a record of hours and duties. If the answer suggests a protected trait played a role, Jordy reads the EEOC page. Jordy also asks a qualified adviser early, because formal complaints have deadlines.

## Pacing

Full chapter: 25 min.

 Short on time: 25 min.

## Say this

"Read each branch of your plan aloud. Does Jordy know what to do next in every case?" — Partners test each other's plans.

## Watch for

**Misconception:** The plan starts with a legal complaint.

**Listen for:** "Jordy should file with the EEOC right away."

**Then:** Ask what Jordy knows so far: a rate difference and a title. The first step is asking Dana.

## Answer key

### What to notice in the sample:

1. Opens with a question, not an accusation.
2. Uses Gia's information without naming her or her rate.
3. Plans for a need for more facts, not only a yes or a no.
4. Covers the possible legal issue and its deadlines.

## Check your work

**On your own** Answer the Check your work questions and mark your level in each rubric row. Then write one change you made. About 6 minutes.

Does your record match the documents exactly? ☒ Yes ☐ No

Does your message use Gia's rate only as she agreed? ☒ Yes ☐ No

Does it ask what shift lead includes and how rates are set, without claiming discrimination? ☒ Yes ☐ No

Does your plan separate a satisfying answer, a need for more facts and a possible legal issue? ☒ Yes ☐ No

### How your work is scored

Mark one box in each row.

| Skill                         | Beginning                                                | Developing                                      | Proficient                                                      | Advanced                                                                     |
|-------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Evidence</b>               | <input type="checkbox"/> Relies on assumption.           | <input type="checkbox"/> Mentions the gap only. | <input type="checkbox"/> Cites duties, hours and rate.          | <input type="checkbox"/> Cites records and acknowledges what isn't known.    |
| <b>Reasoning</b>              | <input type="checkbox"/> Declares discrimination.        | <input type="checkbox"/> Assumes the reason.    | <input type="checkbox"/> Asks for criteria before concluding.   | <input type="checkbox"/> Identifies possible legitimate factors to test.     |
| <b>Audience &amp; purpose</b> | <input type="checkbox"/> Threatens or exposes coworkers. | <input type="checkbox"/> Polite but vague.      | <input type="checkbox"/> Specific question to the right person. | <input type="checkbox"/> Specific question that protects coworkers' privacy. |

## ⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 6 min.

✂ Short on time: 5 min. Students answer the Check your work questions only.

## 💬 Say this

“Read your message as Dana. Could you answer it in one reply?” — Partners swap and underline the question.

## 👁 Watch for

**Misconception:** Students revise tone only. **Listen for:** “I made it nicer.” **Then:** Point to the Revision row. Ask them to replace a conclusion with a question.

## 🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

## 🔑 Answer key

**How to assess:** Score with the case rubric. Add checks that the message makes no accusation and that the plan describes the EEOC and NLRB pages accurately.

### Proficient looks like:

- **Evidence:** Cites duties, hours and rate.
- **Reasoning:** Asks for criteria before concluding.
- **Audience & purpose:** Specific question to the right person.
- **Revision:** Replaces conclusion with a question.

## How your work is scored, continued

| Skill    | Beginning                           | Developing                          | Proficient                                                    | Advanced                                                                       |
|----------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Revision | <input type="checkbox"/> No change. | <input type="checkbox"/> Tone only. | <input type="checkbox"/> Replaces conclusion with a question. | <input type="checkbox"/> Explains how changes protect Jordy and get an answer. |

### One change I made after feedback

I changed \_\_\_ because \_\_\_.

➤ I added a line about deadlines to my plan, because formal complaints have deadlines and Jordy should ask an adviser early.

## Notes

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal blue lines, resembling notebook paper. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There is no handwriting or other markings on the paper.

This page continues page 228. The notes for both pages are on the sheet for page 228.

## Questions to discuss

**On your own** Write a short answer to each question. Then complete each sentence frame below the questions. About 10 minutes.

- 1 What information could explain the \$1.50 difference, and what might challenge that explanation?

➤ Lead duties, experience or a payroll mistake could explain it. The explanation weakens if shift lead has no written duties, or if other crew earn more without the title.

- 2 Whose choice is it to make Jordy's pay public, and why?

➤ Jordy's. The NLRB says most private-sector workers may discuss their own pay, with or without a union. That right does not cover posting Gia's statement, which she asked Jordy not to post.

- 3 What answer from Dana would satisfy Jordy, and what answer would not?

➤ Criteria for each rate, applied to both roles, would satisfy Jordy. A vague appeal to experience, or no explanation at all, would leave the question open.

- 4 In the soccer case, the judge looked at contract structures, and the players wanted him to compare rates of pay. Why does that choice matter?

➤ The comparison decides what counts as unequal. Contract structure and totals can make pay look fair while rates differ, and the 2022 settlement did not decide which comparison was right.

## ⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 10 min.

✂ Short on time: 10 min.

## 💬 Say this

"Answer with a detail from a document, not a guess about the company." — Hear one answer per question, then ask who disagrees.

## ➤ Stretch

- Draft the pay-policy page the company could share: each role, its duties, its rate and how to qualify.
- Going further: Read the EEOC page on pay discrimination. Which law could apply to Jordy's question? Which facts would you need before saying the law was broken?
- Going further: What might make it hard for a worker like Jordy to ask about pay? Write one sentence that names Jordy's concern without claiming more than Jordy knows.
- Going further: Draw a timeline of the evidence, from the posted schedule to Jordy's question for Dana. Mark each open question on it. Then compare it with your message: which one makes the open questions easier to follow?
- Going further: When you start a job, ask for your pay rate and how it is set, in writing. Keep your own record of hours and duties. If something seems off, talk with a trusted adult or a school counselor.
- Find your state labor department's page on pay equity
- Research the EEOC's filing deadlines and how they vary by state

## My take

My claim: \_\_\_\_.

👉 Jordy should ask Dana for the criteria in writing and keep a personal record of hours and duties.

The best evidence is \_\_\_\_, because \_\_\_\_.

👉 The text messages, because they show what Gia did as shift lead and what she agreed to share.

Someone who disagrees might say \_\_\_\_.

👉 Asking Dana first gives the company time, and deadlines apply to formal complaints.

The limit of the evidence is \_\_\_\_.

👉 We have one pay statement and one schedule. No document shows how the company sets rates.

I would change my mind if \_\_\_\_.

👉 Dana named criteria that match Gia's lead duties and showed how Jordy could qualify.

## Notes

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

This page continues page 230.

## Heat check

■ ■ □ **Question 1: Medium.** Students may guess that Jordy's race or gender explains the gap, or bring up a family member's pay.

**Cool-down:** Ask which document shows the reason. None does. Sort the ideas into "could be lawful," "could be unlawful" and "need facts."

## Talk about this case at home

### Case 11: Why are Jordy and Gia paid different rates?

In this case, two friends who worked the same event find out one is paid \$1.50 more an hour. Your student compared their records and wrote a respectful message asking a supervisor how pay rates are set.

#### Questions to talk about

- 1 What questions could someone ask about pay when starting a new job?
- 2 Why might a person want to keep their pay private?
- 3 What makes a question to a boss sound respectful?

Nobody needs to share personal stories or private information to talk about this case.



See the case online.

## Case 11 | Talk about this case at home | College educator edition

### 🕒 Pacing

At home: this page takes no class time.

### 💬 Say this

“Bring this page home or read it with someone you trust.”  
— Nobody needs to share their own pay or a family member’s pay.