

Case 11: Why are Jordy and Gia paid different rates?

Jordy and Gia worked the same Saturday event, but Gia's pay rate is \$1.50 an hour higher, and Jordy wants to know why.

On your own Read What happened. Underline the two pay rates and the job title on the schedule. About 5 minutes.



Mateo attaches an arrival notice at the Common Room entrance. Gia points to the doorway, and Jordy checks what a visitor will see.

Your role: You're the one who lines up both shifts side by side before Jordy writes to Dana. **New skill:** Compare two cases on the same terms.

What happened

Jordy and Gia work event shifts for the same company. They both worked a Saturday event from 3 to 11 p.m. Both helped with setup and closing, and Jordy also ran the caption and audio check.

They were paid the following Friday. On Sunday afternoon, Jordy and Gia compare pay statements. Jordy's lists eight hours at \$16.50 an hour. Gia's lists \$18.00 an hour for the same event.

The crew schedule lists Gia as "shift lead," but it does not say what that job includes. That day, Gia opened up and handled one guest issue. She does not know if that explains the \$1.50 difference. Gia is fine with Jordy knowing her rate. But she does not want her statement posted.

Jordy wants to ask Dana, the supervisor, how rates are set. Jordy will not post anything before Dana answers.

Your question: Why is Gia paid more than Jordy for the same event, and how should Jordy ask about it?

Key terms

On your own Read each key term and its example. Then write your first guess about the pay difference. About 6 minutes.

Compensation Compensation is all the pay and benefits a worker receives, including hourly rates, bonuses and overtime.

En español: compensación

In this case: Jordy's statement shows eight hours at \$16.50 an hour, and Gia's shows \$18.00. The statements show the rates but not how they were set.

Equal Pay Act The Equal Pay Act is a federal law from 1963 that requires equal pay for men and women who do equal work.

En español: Ley de Igualdad Salarial

In this case: The Equal Pay Act covers pay differences based on sex, not every difference. Different job duties, such as a real shift-lead role, can be a lawful reason.

Title VII Title VII is part of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. It bans job discrimination based on race, color, religion, sex or national origin.

En español: Título VII

In this case: Title VII covers pay decisions based on race, color, religion, sex or national origin. No document shows how Jordy's rate was set.

Who is involved



Jordy

Worked setup through close

"Three to eleven, setup to close, and I ran the caption and audio check. \$16.50 an hour. Gia's says \$18.00."



Gia

Listed as shift lead

"I only found out I make more because Jordy showed me theirs. The schedule calls me shift lead. Nobody told me what that pays for."

Before you look at the evidence, why do you think Gia is paid more than Jordy?

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal blue lines, resembling notebook paper. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There is no handwriting or other markings on the paper.

Reading passage

Same event, different rate

On your own Read the passage. At each Stop and think box, pause and answer the question in your head or with a partner. About 5 minutes.

Words to know

- **Compensation:** Compensation is all the pay and benefits a worker receives, including hourly rates, bonuses and overtime.
- **Equal Pay Act:** The Equal Pay Act is a federal law from 1963 that requires equal pay for men and women who do equal work.
- **Title VII:** Title VII is part of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. It bans job discrimination based on race, color, religion, sex or national origin.
- **Gross pay:** Gross pay is the money you earn before any taxes or other deductions are taken out.

The story: Comparing pay statements

Jordy and Gia work event shifts for the same company. Last Saturday, they both worked an event from 3 to 11 p.m. Both helped set up and close. Jordy also ran the caption and audio check.

On Sunday afternoon, they compare pay statements. Jordy's says eight hours at \$16.50 an hour. Gia's says \$18.00 an hour for the same event. "Wait what," Gia texts. "Is it because I'm shift lead?"

The crew schedule does list Gia as "shift lead." But it never says what that job includes. That day, Gia opened up and handled one guest issue. She honestly does not know if that explains the \$1.50 difference.

Jordy wants to ask Dana, the supervisor, how rates are set. Jordy will not post anything before Dana answers. Your role is to line up both shifts side by side before Jordy writes to Dana.

Stop and think. What facts are the same for Jordy and Gia, and what facts are different?

Lining up the facts

In Case 5, you read a pay statement line by line. You learned that **gross pay** is the money you earn before any taxes or other deductions are taken out. Jordy's gross pay for the event is \$132.00, which is 8 hours times \$16.50.

Lining up the facts, continued

Now compare the two jobs on the same terms. The hours match. Setup and closing match. Jordy did the caption and audio check. Gia had the shift lead title, opened up and handled one guest issue.

Compensation is all the pay and benefits a worker receives, including hourly rates, bonuses and overtime. A job title, extra duties or more experience can explain a pay difference. So can a mistake. The statements show the rates. They do not show how the rates were set.

In Case 10, you learned to take a question to the office responsible. Here, that is Dana. Jordy's message can say what Jordy knows for sure: the hours, the duties and Jordy's own rate. Then it can ask one clear question: what does "shift lead" include, and how are rates set?

Gia is fine with Jordy knowing her rate. But she does not want her statement posted anywhere. That choice belongs to Gia, and posting Jordy's own pay is Jordy's choice.

 **Stop and think.** What could explain the \$1.50 difference?

The laws and a famous pay fight

Two federal laws limit how employers set pay. The **Equal Pay Act** is a federal law from 1963 that requires equal pay for men and women who do equal work. **Title VII** is part of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. It bans job discrimination based on race, color, religion, sex or national origin.

In 2022, the U.S. women's national soccer team won a \$24 million settlement in its equal pay fight (NPR, February 22, 2022). The whole fight turned on what to compare. Jordy's question starts the same way.

 **Stop and think.** Why does Jordy want Dana's answer before posting anything?

Sources

Real source | NPR | February 22, 2022

The U.S. national women's soccer team wins \$24 million in equal pay settlement

Look at the evidence

On your own Read each document. For each one, fill in both boxes. About 10 minutes.

Evidence A | Pay statement

Jordy’s pay statement

Event crew, Saturday. Hours: 8.0 at \$16.50. Gross pay for the event: \$132.00.

Look closely: Multiply the hours by the rate. Does it match the gross pay?

What it shows

One question I still have

Evidence B | Work schedule

The crew schedule

Saturday event, 3:00—11:00 p.m. Crew: Gia (shift lead), Jordy and two other crew members. Setup, 3:00—5:00: all crew. Caption and audio check: Jordy. Closing, 10:00—11:00: all crew.

Look closely: Circle “shift lead.” Does the schedule say what that job includes?

What it shows

One question I still have

Look at the evidence, continued

Evidence C | Text messages

Jordy and Gia compare notes

- Sunday, 1:15 p.m.
- Gia: I'm fine with you knowing my rate. I just don't want my statement posted anywhere.
- Jordy: Got it. Did you do anything different as shift lead?
- Gia: I opened up and handled one guest issue. Honestly, I don't know if that's why. Let's ask Dana.

Look closely: What does Gia agree to share, and what does she ask Jordy not to do?

What it shows

One question I still have

What is still missing from the evidence?

Key idea: equal pay

On your own Read the key idea and the code of ethics. Then answer the question in the box. About 6 minutes.

Before you can say why Jordy is paid less, you need to know what each job included. **Compensation** is all the pay and benefits a worker receives, including hourly rates, bonuses and overtime. A job title, extra duties or more experience can explain a pay difference. So can a mistake. The pay statements show the rates, but they do not show how the rates were set.

Federal laws limit the reasons an employer can use to set pay. The **Equal Pay Act** is a federal law from 1963 that requires equal pay for men and women who do equal work. **Title VII** is part of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. It bans job discrimination based on race, color, religion, sex or national origin. Both laws apply to covered employers, and the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) enforces them. A legitimate reason, such as different job duties, can lawfully explain a pay difference.

Talking about pay is protected too. The National Labor Relations Board (NLRB) says most private-sector workers have a right to discuss pay with coworkers. That right holds with or without a union. It does not make Gia's pay statement Jordy's to share. Jordy can ask Dana how rates are set without naming Gia's rate.

Professional standards

Real source | Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM)

SHRM Code of Ethics: Fairness and Justice

“Develop, administer, and advocate policies and procedures that foster fair, consistent and equitable treatment for all.”

In plain words: HR professionals who belong to SHRM agree to use workplace policies that treat workers fairly and consistently.

Question: The schedule lists Gia as shift lead. What written policy would show whether that title explains the higher rate?

Your answer

Jordy would need a written ___ that says ____.

A real 'same work, different pay' dispute that ended in a settlement and a promise of equal rates.



Why the claim was first dismissed: the judge compared how the contracts were structured. What you compare shapes the answer.

[illegible]

Sort the evidence

On your own Line up the accounts in the diagram. Then name one view that is missing. About 8 minutes.

Line up the accounts. Where do they agree, where do they differ, and which difference could be a legitimate factor? What would you need to find out before calling it unfair?

Account 1
Jordy’s record: 8 hours, setup, caption and audio check, closing, \$16.50

Account 2
Gia’s account: same hours, setup and closing, opened up and handled one guest issue, \$18.00

Account 3
The schedule: Gia listed as shift lead, with no description of the role

Where they agree

Where they differ

Check: Ask the supervisor how rates are set and what the shift-lead role requires

Whose perspective is missing?

Whose view is missing from these documents? What would you ask them?

The view that is missing is _____. I would ask _____.

Practice: choose a response

On your own Choose what Jordy should do first and explain why. Then fix the two marked lines.
About 6 minutes.

Jordy’s statement shows \$16.50 an hour. Gia’s shows \$18.00 for the same Saturday event, and the schedule lists her as “shift lead.” What should Jordy do first?

- ☐ **A** Tell the rest of the crew that Gia is paid more for the same work.
- ☐ **B** Compare what each of them did, find out what “shift lead” means and ask Dana how rates are set.
- ☐ **C** Let it go, because an employer can set any pay rate it chooses.

Why I chose it

Improve a draft

A student’s first draft

Hi, I found out Gia makes more than me and we did the exact same work so **1** this is discrimination. I know it’s because of who I am. I want the same rate as her starting now or I’m going to post about it everywhere so people know how this company treats workers. **2** I have her pay stub as proof. I’ve worked here longer than some people and I always show up on time. Let me know by tomorrow. Jordy

Rewrite each marked phrase so it says only what the evidence supports.

Rewrite phrase 1

Rewrite phrase 2

Grades 6—8

Your task

On your own Read the steps. Fill in the planner boxes before you start your draft.

Make a side-by-side chart of Jordy's and Gia's work, then write one question Jordy could ask.

Use: The two statements and the event schedule.

You'll make: Chart plus a one-sentence question

Time: 45 minutes

- 1 Read Jordy's pay statement in Evidence A. Circle the hours and the rate.
- 2 Read the schedule in Evidence B. Underline each person's job title and duties.
- 3 Fill in the chart for Jordy and for Gia: duties, hours, title and rate.
- 4 Circle the row where Jordy and Gia are different.
- 5 Write one question for Dana in the Your draft box. Do not guess the reason.

Show it your way

Write it: Write one question under your chart with the frame "Both __. But __. I want to ask __."

Say it: Tell a partner one way Jordy's and Gia's work was the same and one way it might have been different, then say Jordy's question aloud.

Show it: Complete the side-by-side chart with icons for duties, hours, title and rate, and circle the row that is different.



Prefer typing? Scan to open the online workspace.

Your task, continued

What is the same for Jordy and Gia

Both ____.

What is different

But ____.

Your draft

Jordy’s question for Dana

I want to ask ____.

Notes

Check your work

On your own Answer the Check your work questions and mark your level in each rubric row. Then write one change you made. About 5 minutes.

Does your chart show the hours, duties, title and rate for each person?

☐ Yes☐ No

Does your question ask for the reason instead of guessing it?

☐ Yes☐ No

Does your question keep Gia’s pay statement private?

☐ Yes☐ No

How your work is scored

Mark one box in each row.

Skill	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Advanced
Evidence	☐ Relies on assumption.	☐ Mentions the gap only.	☐ Cites duties, hours and rate.	☐ Cites records and acknowledges what isn’t known.
Reasoning	☐ Declares discrimination.	☐ Assumes the reason.	☐ Asks for criteria before concluding.	☐ Identifies possible legitimate factors to test.
Audience & purpose	☐ Threatens or exposes coworkers.	☐ Polite but vague.	☐ Specific question to the right person.	☐ Specific question that protects coworkers’ privacy.
Revision	☐ No change.	☐ Tone only.	☐ Replaces conclusion with a question.	☐ Explains how changes protect Jordy and get an answer.

One change I made

[illegible]

Questions to discuss

On your own Write a short answer to each question. Then complete each sentence frame below the questions. About 8 minutes.

- 1** What information could explain the \$1.50 difference, and what might challenge that explanation?

- 2** Whose choice is it to make Jordy's pay public, and why?

- 3** What answer from Dana would satisfy Jordy, and what answer would not?

My take

I think Jordy should ___ because ____.

The evidence that changed my first guess is ____.

One question I still have is ___.

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal blue lines, resembling notebook paper. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There are no margins, text, or other markings on the paper.

Talk about this case at home

Case 11: Why are Jordy and Gia paid different rates?

In this case, two friends who worked the same event find out one is paid \$1.50 more an hour. Your student compared their records and wrote a respectful message asking a supervisor how pay rates are set.

Questions to talk about

- 1 What questions could someone ask about pay when starting a new job?
- 2 Why might a person want to keep their pay private?
- 3 What makes a question to a boss sound respectful?

Nobody needs to share personal stories or private information to talk about this case.



See the case online.