

Case 4: Who gets a say when a shared room changes?

Overview

Students read a short story about the Common Room, where a nonprofit board is considering paid evening rentals. The rentals would help close a \$200 weekly budget gap. Students read the board agenda, a budget note and listening notes from evening users, then map who might miss the meeting. They write a note or a spoken comment with a budget question and an access question.

Before this case

Students should already be able to:

- read a simple budget and find a gap
- state a position on a choice between options
- speak from a short script

Objectives

Students will be able to:

- recommend one option and state it early
- use a figure accurately and as a projection
- name a group the option would affect
- make a request the board can act on

Materials

- This chapter, one copy per student
- Evidence A, B and C
- The four-part comment template
- A timer for practice with a partner

The task in this edition

Task: Prepare a 90-second public comment recommending an option, using at least one figure accurately.

Students make: 90-second spoken comment (about 200 words) with written script

Pacing

Opener (page 62): 5 min. Short on time: 4 min. Read What happened aloud. Skip the opening question.

Key terms (pages 63 and 64): 5 min. Short on time: skip. Define proposal and trade-off aloud in one minute.

Look at the evidence (page 68): 10 min. Short on time: 9 min. Work the gap together. Students fill in only the “What it shows” boxes.

Look at the evidence (page 69): 5 min. Short on time: 3 min. Read the listening notes aloud. Students fill in only the first box.

Key idea (pages 70 and 71): 8 min. Short on time: 4 min. Read the first paragraph of the key idea aloud. Skip the code of ethics.

Sort the evidence (page 72): 8 min. Short on time: skip.

Practice (page 73): 6 min. Short on time: skip.

Your task (page 74): 8 min. Short on time: 6 min. Students fill in the option and figure boxes only.

Pacing, continued

Your draft (page 75): 18 min. Short on time: 16 min. Students write the comment in class and time it at home.

Check your work (pages 76 and 77): 8 min. Short on time: 3 min. Students record their time and one change. Skip the rubric boxes.

Questions to discuss (pages 78 and 79): 10 min. Short on time: 5 min. Use question 1 as an exit ticket.

Talk about this case at home (page 80): at home.

Periods: full chapter 91 minutes; one period 50 minutes.

Standards

RI.9-10.1 Support an analysis with solid, complete evidence from the text, both for what it states and for what it implies.

RI.9-10.8 Evaluate an argument’s claims, reasoning and evidence, and identify false statements and faulty reasoning.

W.9-10.1.a Introduce a precise claim, distinguish it from opposing claims and organize the claims, counterclaims, reasons and evidence clearly.

W.9-10.1.b Develop claims and counterclaims fairly, giving evidence for each and their strengths and limits, with the audience in mind.

Case 4 plan, continued

Standards, continued

SL.9-10.1.c Move a discussion forward with questions that connect it to larger ideas, bring others in and test ideas and conclusions.

SL.9-10.1.d Respond to different views, sum up where people agree and disagree, and adjust your view when the evidence calls for it.

D2.Civ.13.9-12 Evaluate public policies by their intended and unintended outcomes and consequences. In this case: Students evaluate each option's intended and unintended outcomes.

D2.Civ.9.9-12 Use fitting deliberative processes in different settings. In this case: Students use a deliberative process to weigh options before recommending one.

Codes of ethics

- **ASPA Code of Ethics:** 5. Fully Inform and Advise.
- **ASPA Code of Ethics:** 3. Promote democratic participation.
- **ALA Code of Ethics:** Principle 1 (of 9)

Heat map

- **Opener (page 62):** Low
- **Key terms (pages 63 and 64):** Low
- **Look at the evidence (page 68):** Low
- **Look at the evidence (page 69):** Low
- **Key idea (pages 70 and 71):** Low

Heat map, continued

- **Sort the evidence (page 72):** Medium
- **Practice (page 73):** Low
- **Check your work (pages 76 and 77):** Low

Try it at your school

Find the room where your community's decisions happen.

- With a trusted adult, look up an upcoming library board, school committee or rec-center meeting agenda
- Identify which body decides and whether the item is for discussion or a vote
- Write one question about who uses the space and when
- Check whether written comments are accepted if you can't attend

Who to ask: Library staff, a rec-center manager, the school board clerk or a student council advisor

Safety: Go to public meetings with a trusted adult. Check whether comments and names become part of the public record before submitting.

Sources

- New York City Council, "NYC Council, Library Leaders, and New Yorkers Celebrate Library Budget Restorations to Restore Full Service, as Branches Reopen and Reinstate Services on Sunday for First Time in Months," July 14, 2024
- NYC Mayor's Office, "Mayor Adams Celebrates \$58.3 Million Investment in City's Three Library Systems," July 1, 2024
- NY1, "Public libraries over the next two weeks to begin closing on Sundays," November 17, 2023
- PIX11 News, "Last Sunday service held at Brooklyn Public Library," December 17, 2023
- Carol Bacchi, "What's the problem represented to be?," No date listed
- NYC.gov, Brooklyn Community Board 13, "About community boards," No date listed
- Design Council, "The Double Diamond," No date listed

Case 4: Who gets a say when a shared room changes?

The Common Room’s board is weighing paid rentals on two free evenings, so the crew prepares a comment before the meeting.

On your own Read What happened. Underline who decides and what the board is considering. About 5 minutes.

Your role: You’re the one who checks the budget figures before the crew speaks to the board. **New skill:** Weigh the trade-offs of each option.



Mari shows Sami a printed schedule.

What happened

It is the Friday after the crew’s first screening, and the board meeting is coming up. A small neighborhood nonprofit runs the Common Room alongside the bookshop. The nonprofit’s board is considering paid rentals on two evenings a week to help cover staffing. No vote has happened yet.

Mari, 19, works the bookshop counter and closes the shop. She knows that “just keep it free” does not pay the evening staff. Sami runs a print workshop in the room after her afternoon shift. It is one of the few step-free rooms nearby.

Caio, 24, runs the crew’s Tuesday film night. Tuesday is one of the evenings Option B would rent out. Mateo already has a headline for a petition. The crew agrees the room matters, but they do not agree on the best schedule.

Your question: Which option should the crew support, and what should they ask the board?

⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 5 min.

✂ Short on time: 4 min. Read What happened aloud. Skip the opening question.

💬 Say this

“A room you use might lose two free evenings. What would you want to know before you speak up?” — Take three answers and write them as questions.

👁 Watch for

Misconception: Students assume the change is already decided. **Listen for:** “They’re taking our nights away.” **Then:** Point to the story: no vote has happened. Write “proposal” on the board.

📋 Support

- Read What happened aloud while students follow along.
- Draw the Common Room’s week on the board and mark Tuesday and Thursday.

🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

Key terms

On your own Read each key term and its example. Then write your first guess in the box. About 5 minutes.

Proposal A proposal is a change that someone suggests and that has not been approved yet.

En español: propuesta

In this case: Option B is a proposal on the board's agenda. No vote has been taken, so it is not a decision yet.

Trade-off A trade-off is a choice where getting one benefit means accepting a cost or giving something up.

En español: compensación entre opciones

In this case: Paid rentals help close the \$200 weekly gap but take away free evenings Sami and Dec use.

Decision-maker A decision-maker is the person or group with the power to make a particular choice.

En español: quien toma la decisión

In this case: The nonprofit board decides, not a city community board and not the crew.

Who is involved



Mari

Closes the bookshop, then stays for zine night

"I'm the one they pay to lock up, and I'm also one of the people using this room after. I can't pretend either half away."



Sami

Runs a print workshop in the room

"We keep deciding what the evening people need. Has anyone asked them yet?"

⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 5 min.

✂ Short on time: skip this page. Skip this page. Define proposal and trade-off aloud in one minute.

💬 Say this

"Write your first guess now. You will come back to it at the end." — Keep first guesses private unless a student wants to share.

👁 Watch for

Misconception: Students think a proposal is a decision.

Listen for: "The board decided to rent it out." **Then:** Reread the definition. A proposal has not been approved yet.

📖 Support

- Pair students who share a language to explain each term.
- Frame: "A trade-off here is _____. The cost is _____."
- **Cognates:** option (opción), projection (proyección), community (comunidad), access (acceso), authority (autoridad), equity (equidad), pilot (piloto), decision (decisión).

🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

🔑 Answer key

Any first guess is fine. Students return to it on the My take page.

Before you look at the evidence, what do you think the crew should ask the board for?

➤ My first guess is keeping both evenings free, because the free nights are why people use the room.

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal blue ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There is no handwriting or other markings on the paper.

Reading passage

A headline is not a budget

On your own Read the passage. At each Stop and think box, pause and answer the question in your head or with a partner. About 5 minutes.

Words to know

- **Proposal:** A proposal is a change that someone suggests and that has not been approved yet.
- **Trade-off:** A trade-off is a choice where getting one benefit means accepting a cost or giving something up.
- **Decision-maker:** A decision-maker is the person or group with the power to make a particular choice.
- **Framing:** Framing is choosing which parts of a situation a message brings forward.

The story: A room with two kinds of value

It is the Friday after the crew's first screening, and the board meeting is coming up. The Common Room is run by a small neighborhood nonprofit alongside the bookshop, and its board is considering paid rentals on two evenings a week to help cover staffing. Nothing has been decided. Still, the group chat moves fast. Mateo announces that he already has a petition headline.

Mari slows him down. She is 19, works the bookshop counter and is the person paid to close the shop at night. She is also one of the people who use the room afterward, for zine nights with her friends. "I can't pretend either half away," she says. On rental nights, she would be staffing a stranger's event instead of making zines. Maybe that is fine, she admits, but it is still a cost, and nobody has written it down.

Sami, who works afternoons and runs a print workshop in the room in the evening, points to a different gap. The crew keeps deciding what evening users need without asking them. Moving her workshop online would not help. Her printing tools do not fit in a video call. Mateo reads the thread and concedes the point. He had a headline. He did not have the budget.

Stop and think. Mari is paid to close the shop and also uses the room at night. How does that shape what she asks for?

Options, numbers and trade-offs

Start with the Case 1 skill and read the original documents. The board agenda lists three options for discussion. Option A keeps the free evenings, and the funding gap remains.

Pacing

Reading: about 5 min (596 words). Short on time: read it aloud together, pausing at each Stop and think.

Stop and think

1. **After “The story: A room with two kinds of value”:** Mari is paid to close the shop and also uses the room at night. How does that shape what she asks for?
2. **After “Options, numbers and trade-offs”:** Option B frames the \$200 gap as the problem. What does that way of stating the problem leave out?
3. **After “Who decides, in the room and in the city”:** If the board chooses an option the crew did not support, how should the crew tell the group what happened?

Options, numbers and trade-offs, continued

Option B replaces the Tuesday and Thursday evenings with paid rentals. Option C pilots one rental evening for six weeks while the board seeks more funding. Each is a **proposal**, a change that someone suggests and that has not been approved yet.

The weekly budget note shows \$600 in evening staffing and utilities against \$400 in grants and donations, a \$200 gap. Each rental is projected to add \$120 after its extra costs. Two would add \$240 and one would add \$120, but the note warns that demand is uncertain. The listening notes add the human side. Sami works afternoons. Dec rehearses on Thursdays. Mari closes the shop. A nearby resident worries about late noise, and the meeting time overlaps several shifts.

Every option is a **trade-off**, a choice where getting one benefit means accepting a cost or giving something up. Case 2 taught you to ask what a task is meant to measure. Ask the same of each option: what problem is it designed to solve? Case 1's idea of **framing** helps too. Option B frames the \$200 gap as the problem and the free evenings as the price. That frame leaves two questions open. Who loses those evenings, and what happens if bookings come in lower than projected? Ask the same questions about your own favorite option.

? **Stop and think.** Option B frames the \$200 gap as the problem. What does that way of stating the problem leave out?

Who decides, in the room and in the city

A **decision-maker** is the person or group with the power to make a particular choice. The nonprofit's board controls its own schedule. A city is different. When budget cuts closed New York's libraries on Sundays, Brooklyn's last Sunday of service was December 17, 2023 (NY1, November 17, 2023). The restored funding, part of a \$58.3 million investment, let the libraries resume Sunday service in July 2024 (NYC Mayor's Office, July 1, 2024). Council members credited New Yorkers who called and wrote (New York City Council, July 14, 2024).

Other communities have handed more of the choice to residents. Evanston, Illinois, let anyone 14 and older help decide how to spend \$3 million in public money (PBS, May 29, 2024). Your role in this case is to check the budget figures before the crew speaks to the board.

? **Stop and think.** If the board chooses an option the crew did not support, how should the crew tell the group what happened?

Sources

Real source | NY1 | November 17, 2023

Public libraries over the next two weeks to begin closing on Sundays

This page continues page 65. The notes for both pages are on the sheet for page 65.

Notes

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal blue ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There is no handwriting or other markings on the paper.

Look at the evidence

On your own Read each document. For each one, write what it shows and what it leaves out. About 10 minutes.

Evidence A | Board agenda, Wednesday 6:30 p.m. meeting

The proposal

Evening rentals, for discussion. Option A: keep the current free evenings; the funding gap remains. Option B: replace Tuesday and Thursday evenings with paid rentals. Option C: pilot one rental evening for six weeks while seeking additional funding. No vote has been taken.

Look closely: Is this a vote or a discussion? Which words tell you?

What it shows

➤ Three options are up for discussion, and no vote has been taken.

What it leaves out

➤ Who uses each evening, and what happens if the pilot falls short.

Evidence B | Weekly budget note for the board

The budget note

Evening staffing and utilities: \$600. Current grants and donations: \$400. Each paid rental is projected to add \$120 after its extra costs. Two bookings would add \$240; one would add \$120. Demand is uncertain.

Look closely: Which number is a guess, and what could change it?

What it shows

➤ The weekly gap is \$200. Two rentals could cover it if the projection holds.

What it leaves out

➤ Whether the \$120 projection is based on any past bookings.

Case 4 | Look at the evidence | Grades 9–10 educator edition

⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 10 min.

✂ Short on time: 9 min. Work the gap together. Students fill in only the “What it shows” boxes.

💬 Say this

“Put your finger on the word “projected” in the budget note. What does it tell you about the \$120?” — Wait for “it’s a guess.”

👁 Watch for

Misconception: Students treat \$120 per rental as guaranteed. **Listen for:** “Two rentals means \$240, done.” **Then:** Point to “Demand is uncertain.” Ask what happens with one booking, or none.

📚 Support

- Provide a calculator and work $\$600 - \$400 = \$200$ together.
- Read one option at a time aloud.
- **Cognates:** option (opción), projection (proyección), community (comunidad), access (acceso), authority (autoridad), equity (equidad), pilot (piloto), decision (decisión).

🔗 Stretch

- Ask students to work out the gap with zero, one and two rentals, and say which result is a guess.

🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

Look at the evidence, continued

Evidence C | Listening notes from evening users

The missing voices

Sami works afternoons. Dec rehearses on Thursdays. Mari closes the shop. A nearby resident worries about late noise. The proposed meeting time overlaps with several shifts.

Look closely: Whose voice is missing from these four notes?

What it shows

Four evening users have different needs, and the meeting conflicts with shifts.

What it leaves out

Everyone else who uses the room, including people who cannot attend.

What is still missing from the evidence?

Who uses the room on other evenings, whether the \$120 projection rests on any past bookings, what the board will do if the pilot underperforms, and the views of evening users who were not in the listening notes.

Notes

Pacing

Full chapter: 5 min.

 Short on time: 3 min. Read the listening notes aloud. Students fill in only the first box.

Say this

“Put your finger on the word “projected” in the budget note. What does it tell you about the \$120?” — Wait for “it’s a guess.”

Watch for

Misconception: Students treat \$120 per rental as guaranteed. **Listen for:** “Two rentals means \$240, done.” **Then:** Point to “Demand is uncertain.” Ask what happens with one booking, or none.

Support

- Provide a calculator and work $\$600 - \$400 = \$200$ together.
- Read one option at a time aloud.
- **Cognates:** option (opción), projection (proyección), community (comunidad), access (acceso), authority (autoridad), equity (equidad), pilot (piloto), decision (decisión).

Stretch

- Ask students to work out the gap with zero, one and two rentals, and say which result is a guess.

Heat check

Low.

Key idea: trade-offs

On your own Read the key idea and the code of ethics. Then answer the question in the box. About 8 minutes.

The board is weighing a **proposal** about the free evenings. A proposal is a change that someone suggests and that has not been approved yet. Option B would help close the \$200 weekly gap, but it would end the free Tuesday and Thursday evenings. A **trade-off** is a choice where getting one benefit means accepting a cost or giving something up. Every option on the agenda has one, including the one you prefer.

Carol Bacchi's policy-analysis approach asks what a proposed solution assumes the problem is. Option B treats the \$200 gap as the problem and two free evenings as the price. That leaves two questions open: who loses those evenings, and what happens if bookings come in lower than projected? Ask the same questions about your own favorite option.

A **decision-maker** is the person or group with the power to make a particular choice. Here, the nonprofit's board controls its own schedule. A community board or a city agency would follow other rules. A strong comment names the proposal, explains one effect with evidence and asks for a decision the board can make. The board can still choose an option the crew did not ask for.

Professional standards

Real source | American Society for Public Administration (ASPA)

ASPA Code of Ethics: 5. Fully Inform and Advise

"Provide accurate, honest, comprehensive, and timely information and advice to elected and appointed officials and governing board members"

In plain words: ASPA members agree to give decision-makers, such as board members, accurate and complete information.

Question: The budget note projects \$120 more per rental. What should it also tell the board about how certain that is?

Your answer

The note should also say ____, because ____.

➡ The note should also say that demand is uncertain and what happens with only one booking, because the gap would stay at \$80.

⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 8 min.

✂ Short on time: 4 min. Read the first paragraph of the key idea aloud. Skip the code of ethics.

💬 Say this

"A trade-off means gaining one benefit costs something else. What does each option cost, and who pays?" — Build a three-column chart: A, B, C.

"The ASPA code asks for accurate, complete information for decision-makers. What is missing from the budget note?" — Wait for the basis of the \$120.

👁 Watch for

Misconception: Students treat the ASPA code as a law.

Listen for: "The board has to follow ASPA." **Then:** Say: "A code of ethics is a standard a profession sets for its own members. The ASPA code is not a law."

📖 Support

- Read the code card aloud. Point out the label: it is a quotation from a real code.

🔗 Stretch

- Read the second ASPA card. Ask how the board could hear from evening users who cannot attend.

🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

Letting Students Decide Where Money Should Go: How One District Did It



St. Louis shuts down streets to cars, hands them over to neighbors

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal blue ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There is no handwriting or other markings on the paper.

Sort the evidence

On your own Follow each option to its consequences. Mark the consequences that depend on a projection. About 8 minutes.

Follow each option to its consequences. Which consequences depend on a projection, and who carries the cost if it misses?

Option B: paid rentals replace Tuesday and Thursday evenings

A projected \$240 would cover the \$200 gap if both evenings book

Who is affected

Check: What happens if bookings fall short of the projection?

Dec loses Thursday rehearsals and Mari's late evenings stop being usable

Who is affected

→ Evening users, including people who cannot attend the meeting

Option C: one rental evening piloted for six weeks

A projected \$80 gap remains while the board seeks funding and reviews the pilot

Who is affected

Check: What happens if bookings fall short of the projection?

Whose perspective is missing?

Whose view is missing from these documents? What would you ask them?

The view that is missing is _____. I would ask _____.

→ The view of evening users who were not in the listening notes. I would ask when they use the room and whether they can attend.

⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 8 min.

✂ Short on time: skip this page.

💬 Say this

“Follow Option B to the end of its chain. Which consequence depends on a guess?” — Model the Option B row together.

👁 Watch for

Misconception: Students list only money consequences. **Listen for:** “B makes \$240.” **Then:** Ask who is affected at the end of the chain. Point to Dec on Thursdays.

📄 Support

- Let students write \$ (money) or P (people) next to each consequence before writing sentences.

🔥 Heat check

■ ■ □ **Medium.** The missing-perspective question can lead to talk about access needs or money at home.

Cool-down: Keep it about the people in the case. No student needs to describe their own schedule or budget.

Practice: choose a response

On your own Choose what the crew should ask for first and explain why. Then fix the two marked lines. About 6 minutes.

What should the crew ask the board for first?

- ☐ A Post that the board is taking away the free nights.
- ☒ B Ask for the budget assumptions, who uses each evening and a way to comment without attending.
- ☐ C Support whichever option brings in the most money.

Why I chose it

➤ B. It asks for the assumptions and the users before anyone takes a side. A treats a proposal as final, and C counts only money.

Improve a draft

A student's first draft

➤ 1 The board should not take away our free nights. The Common Room is important to the community and a lot of people use it. I have been coming here for movie nights since it opened and it's one of the only places we can all hang out without paying. Renting it out just shows ➤ 2 the board cares more about money than people. Sami and Dec would lose their spot and that is not fair. Please keep it free for everyone. Thank you for listening.

Rewrite each marked phrase so it says only what the evidence supports.

Rewrite phrase 1

➤ The board is discussing a plan to rent two free evenings. No vote has happened.

Rewrite phrase 2

➤ The budget shows a real \$200 weekly gap.

⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 6 min.

✂ Short on time: skip this page.

💬 Say this

“The meeting is Wednesday. What should the crew ask for first?” — Vote first.

👁 Watch for

Misconception: Students choose A because it feels urgent. **Listen for:** “We have to warn everyone.” **Then:** Ask whether the board has voted. It has not, so A misstates the facts.

🔥 Heat check

■□□ Low.

➤ Answer key

A revised version: I use the Common Room on weeknights, and I'm commenting on the rental options. Option B would replace both Tuesday and Thursday free evenings. Sami meets clients after her print-shop shift, and Dec rehearses Thursdays, so losing both nights hits people with the least flexible schedules. I understand the \$200 weekly gap is real. Option C's one-night pilot could cut it to about \$80 if bookings hold. I'm asking the board to choose the pilot, collect written input from evening users who can't attend, and review the results with them after six weeks.

Other notes on the draft:

- “Sami and Dec would lose their spot” Good affected perspectives. Say which evenings and why they matter.
- “Please keep it free for everyone” Clear position, but the board needs a plan for the gap. What could it do?

Grades 9–10

Your task

On your own Read the steps. Fill in the planner boxes before you start your draft. About 8 minutes.

Prepare a 90-second public comment recommending an option, using at least one figure accurately.

Use: All three evidence cards.

You'll make: 90-second spoken comment (about 200 words) with written script

Time: 50 minutes

- 1 Choose one option from the agenda in Evidence A to support.
- 2 Find one figure in Evidence B that supports your choice.
- 3 Name one person in Evidence C whose evening your option changes.
- 4 Write a comment of about 200 words on the Your draft page.
- 5 Ask the board for one decision or follow-up it can make.
- 6 Read your comment aloud to a partner and time it at 90 seconds or less.



Prefer typing? Scan to open the online workspace.

The option I support

➤ Option C, the six-week pilot of one rental evening.

One figure, stated as a projection

➤ If bookings hold, one rental would leave a projected gap of about \$80.

Someone the choice affects

➤ Dec, who rehearses on Thursdays.

My request

➤ Accept written comments from evening users.

Case 4 | Your task | Grades 9–10 educator edition

⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 8 min.

✂ Short on time: 6 min. Students fill in the option and figure boxes only.

💬 Say this

“Your comment has 90 seconds. What must the board hear first?” — Write position, person, figure, request.

👁 Watch for

Misconception: Students state the \$120 as a promise.

Listen for: “The pilot will bring in \$120.” **Then:** Point to “Demand is uncertain.” Add “if bookings hold.”

📄 Support

- Comment template with four parts
- Timer practice with a partner

🔗 Stretch

- Acknowledge the projected \$80 gap under the pilot and propose how to address it.

📋 Standards

Common Core: RI.9–10.1; RI.9–10.8; W.9–10.1.a; W.9–10.1.b; SL.9–10.1.c; SL.9–10.1.d.

C3 Framework: D2.Civ.13.9–12; D2.Civ.9.9–12.

The Case plan sheet gives each code in plain words.

➤ Answer key

A strong response:

- States a position on a specific option
- Uses a figure accurately and conditionally
- Names an affected group
- Makes a request the board can act on

Your draft

On your own Write your draft in the boxes. Use your planner from the page before. About 18 minutes.

Your 90-second comment, about 200 words

Good evening.

Good evening. I use the Common Room on weeknights, and I'm here about the evening rental options. I support Option C, the six-week pilot of one rental evening. Option B would replace both the Tuesday and Thursday free evenings. Dec rehearses on Thursdays, so he would lose his spot. Sami runs a print workshop here after her afternoon shift, and this is one of the few step-free rooms nearby. The budget note shows a \$200 weekly gap, and I know that gap is real. It projects \$120 per rental, so if bookings hold, the pilot would bring the gap down to about \$80. That still leaves a gap, and demand is uncertain. I'm asking the board for two decisions. First, please share what the \$120 projection is based on. Second, many evening users work during this meeting. Could the board accept written comments for two weeks and review the pilot with evening users after six weeks? Thank you.

Case 4 | Your draft | Grades 9–10 educator edition

Pacing

Full chapter: 18 min.

 Short on time: 16 min. Students write the comment in class and time it at home.

Say this

“Read your comment to a partner who plays a board member. They ask one question.” — Time each comment. Stop at 90 seconds.

Watch for

Misconception: The comment asks for something the board cannot do. **Listen for:** “The city should fund the room.” **Then:** Ask who controls the schedule. The nonprofit board does, so ask it for something it can decide.

Answer key

What to notice in the sample:

1. States a position on a specific option early.
2. Uses the figure as a projection, not a promise.
3. Names an affected person and the evening that matters to him.
4. Makes a request the board can act on.

Check your work

On your own Answer the Check your work questions and mark your level in each rubric row. Then write one change you made. About 8 minutes.

- Does your comment name the option you support? ☒ Yes ☐ No
- Does it use one figure correctly, with words like “projected”? ☒ Yes ☐ No
- Does it name someone the change would affect? ☒ Yes ☐ No
- Does it ask for a decision the board can make? ☒ Yes ☐ No

How your work is scored

Mark one box in each row.

Skill	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Advanced
Evidence	☐ No figures or perspectives.	☐ Mentions money or people vaguely.	☐ Uses one figure and one affected perspective accurately.	☐ Uses figures conditionally and names an uncertainty.
Reasoning	☐ Assigns bad motives to the board.	☐ States a preference without addressing the gap.	☐ Recommends an option and addresses the gap.	☐ Weighs trade-offs across options and explains the choice.
Audience & purpose	☐ Speaks to the wrong decision-maker.	☐ Addresses the board but asks for nothing specific.	☐ Makes a request the board can act on.	☐ Requests a process that includes people who can't attend.
Revision	☐ No change.	☐ Tone edits only.	☐ Replaces a motive claim with evidence.	☐ Adds a figure, a perspective and a follow-up request.

Pacing

Full chapter: 8 min.

 Short on time: 3 min. Students record their time and one change. Skip the rubric boxes.

Say this

“Could a board member act on your request tomorrow? Mark your level, then make one change.” — Ask for one figure stated as a projection.

Watch for

Misconception: Students state the \$120 as certain. **Listen for:** “The pilot will bring in \$120.” **Then:** Point to the Evidence row. Add “is projected to.”

Heat check

☒ ☐ ☐ Low.

Answer key

How to assess: The comment is scored with the case rubric, delivered live or recorded, with a separate check that the figure is stated as a projection.

Proficient looks like:

- **Evidence:** Uses one figure and one affected perspective accurately.
- **Reasoning:** Recommends an option and addresses the gap.
- **Audience & purpose:** Makes a request the board can act on.
- **Revision:** Replaces a motive claim with evidence.

Check your work, continued

My time when I read it aloud

84 seconds

One change I made after practice

I changed ___ because ___.

• I changed “will add \$120” to “is projected to add \$120,” because the budget note says demand is uncertain.

Notes

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal blue ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There is a vertical margin line on the left side, creating a narrow left margin. The paper appears to be from a notebook or a standard sheet of stationery.

This page continues page 76. The notes for both pages are on the sheet for page 76.

Questions to discuss

On your own Write a short answer to each question. Then finish My take. About 10 minutes.

- 1 Option B treats the \$200 gap as the problem. What does that way of stating the problem leave out?

➤ It leaves out who loses the two free evenings, like Dec on Thursdays, and what happens if bookings fall short.

- 2 Mari is paid to close the shop and also uses the room at night. How does that shape what she asks for?

➤ She sees both sides. She wants the free time protected, but she asks which hours earn money and whether a different setup could work.

- 3 If the board chooses an option the crew did not support, how should the crew tell the group what happened?

➤ Share the board's decision and its reasons, say what the crew asked for, and name the next chance to give input.

My take

My claim: ____.

➤ The crew should support the pilot and ask for a plan for the \$80 gap.

The best evidence is ____, because ____.

➤ The budget note, because it shows one rental would leave a projected \$80 gap.

⌚ Pacing

Full chapter: 10 min.

✂ Short on time: 5 min. Use question 1 as an exit ticket.

💬 Say this

“Answer with a detail from the agenda, the budget note or the listening notes.” — Post the question numbers and call on one student per question.

➤ Stretch

- Model what happens if only four of six pilot rentals are booked.
- Going further: Choose one option on the agenda. Write what it assumes the problem is and what it leaves out.
- Going further: Map who is affected by the change, including people who cannot attend the meeting. Then write an invitation that says what is still open to input.
- Going further: Make an annotated options sheet that compares Options A, B and C. Test it with a neighbor, and revise any part that confuses them.
- Going further: With a trusted adult, look up an upcoming library board, school committee or recreation center meeting agenda. Find out whether the item is for discussion or a vote, and whether written comments are accepted.
- Research the difference between a nonprofit board and a public community board in your area

My take, continued

Someone who disagrees might say ____.

Two paid nights would cover the whole gap.

I would change my mind if ____.

➔ Past bookings showed that the \$120 projection is reliable.

Notes

[illegible]

This page continues page 78.

Heat check

Question 3: Medium. Students may describe the board as the enemy or guess at its motives.

Cool-down: Ask what the agenda and budget note show. Keep the talk on the decision, not on the people who made it.

Talk about this case at home

Case 4: Who gets a say when a shared room changes?

In this case, a community room's board is weighing whether to rent out two free evenings to cover its costs. Your student used a budget note and notes from evening users to write a comment the board could act on.

Questions to talk about

- 1 Who decides the hours at a public library or community center?
- 2 What should a group know before it asks a board for a change?
- 3 How can people give input if they cannot attend a meeting?

Nobody needs to share personal stories or private information to talk about this case.



See the case online.

Case 4 | Talk about this case at home | Grades 9–10 educator edition

Pacing

At home: this page takes no class time.

Say this

“Take this page home or read it with someone you trust.” —
Nobody needs to share a personal story to complete it.